

Book Reviews مراجعات الكتب

‘On Celâl Esad Arseven’: a translation and commentary of Ekrem Işın’s Introduction (‘Celâl Esad Arseven üzerine’) in Celâl Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul: Abidat ve Mebanisi (Ancient Istanbul: monuments and buildings)* (Istanbul, 1989), 7-16.....by Maria Vaiou

There are not many monographs on Celâl Esad Arseven (1875-1971)¹. His contribution towards the establishment of art history as a field in

¹ S. Eyice, ‘Arseven, Celâl Esat’, *DIA* (Istanbul, 1991), 397-8; A. K. Gören, ‘Arseven, Celal Esad’, *YYOA* (Istanbul, 2008), I, 252-3; B. Özer, ‘Celal Esad Arseven’, *Mimarlık* 72 (1969), 21-4; E. Işın, ‘Sunuş’, in *Celâl Esad Arseven, Sanat ve Siyaset Hatıralarım* (Istanbul, 1993), 9-24; N. Sinemoğlu, ‘Celal Esad Arseven’, *Celal Esad Arseven Anısına Sanat Tarihi Bildirileri 7-10 Mart 1994* (Istanbul, 2000); D. F. Kickingeder, *Celâl Esad Arseven: ein Leben zwischen Kunst, Politik und Wissenschaft* (Berlin, 2009); idem, ‘Celâl Esad Arseven’s Memoirs of his Life as an artist and a man of politics: Sanat ve Siyaset Hatıralarım (1993)’, in R. Elger and Y. Köse (eds.), *Many ways of speaking about the self. Middle Eastern ego-documents in Arabic, Persian, and Turkish (14th-20th century)* (Wiesbaden, 2010), 37-46. For other references, see M. Cerasi, ‘Late Ottoman architects and master builders’, *Muqarnas* 5 (1988), 87-102, 92n.27; Z. Çelik, *The remaking of Istanbul- Portrait of an Ottoman city in the 19th century* (Seattle, 1986), 121, 150; N. Ozaslan, *Historic urban fabric: source of inspiration for contemporary city form* (D.Phil thesis Univ. of York, 1995), 81; W. M. K. Shaw, *Ottoman painting: reflections of western art from the Ottoman empire to the Turkish Republic* (London, 2011), index; M. Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat Tarihi Yaklaşımları (1850-1923 Sanat Tarihi Yayınları zerine Bir İnceleme (Pre-Republic approaches to art history – A study on the history of art publications between 1850-1923))* (D. Phil. Thesis, Istanbul, 2012); J. M. Bloom, S. S. Blair (eds.), *The Grove Encyclopedia of Islamic art and architecture*, vol. 1 (Oxford, 2009), 225-6; E. Altan Ergut, ‘Celal Esad Arseven’s history of architecture between the past and present’, *Aesthetics bridging cultures: XVIIth Intern. Congress of Aesthetics (9-13 July 2007)* (Ankara, 2007); E. Akcan, *Architecture in translation. Germany, Turkey & the modern house* (Durham and London, 2012), index, 384; Ş. K. Yıldız, ‘A review of Byzantine studies and architectural historiography in Turkey today (1)’, *METU JFA* 28.2 (2011/2), 63-80, 64ff.; C. Bertram, *Imagining the Turkish house. Collective visions of home* (Austin, 2008), index; S. Bosdoğan, ‘Turkish architecture between Ottomanism and modernism (1873- 1931)’, in A. Frangoudaki and Ç. Keyder (eds.), *Ways to modernity in Greece and Turkey: encounters with Europe, 1850-1950* (London and New York, 2007), 113-32; idem ‘Art and architecture in modern Turkey: the Republican period’, in R. Kasaba (ed.), *The Cambridge History of Turkey, vol. IV, Turkey in the modern world* (Cambridge, 2008), 419-71; F. Davis, *The Ottoman lady. A social history from 1718 to 1918* (New York and London, 1986), index; D. Gürpınar, *Ottoman imperial diplomacy. A political, social and cultural history* (London, 2014), index; M. Heper, S. Sayarı, *The Routledge handbook of modern Turkey* (London and New York, 2012), index and the rest of the bibliographical references. For an edition of a study of a cruise Arseven undertook in 1926 to various European harbours in order to represent the Turkish Republic, see *Seyar serge ile seyahat intibaları* (Istanbul, 2008). See also the bibliographical references below.

Turkey has been acknowledged² and his pioneering works on Turkish architecture.³ He was not only an art and architectural historian but a painter, novelist, musician, translator, photographer, writer, editor, playwright, politician and filmmaker. He was the first Turkish scholar to publish on Byzantine history⁴ and buildings of Byzantine Istanbul, and

² N. Yazıcı, 'Pioneer art historians in Turkey', *TALID (Türkiye Araştırmaları Literatür Dergisi)* 7. 14 (2009), 571-608; for a survey of fifty-nine books on art history written in the pre-Republic period (1850-1923), and a discussion of art historiography, see Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*.

³ H. Crane, 'Recent literature on the history of Turkish architecture', *Journal of the Society of Architectural Historians* 31. 4 (Dec., 1972), 309-15, 309, 313; G. Necipoğlu 'Creation of a national genius: Sinan and the historiography of "classical" Ottoman architecture', in J. Bray, S. Bosdoğan and G. Necipoğlu (eds.), *Muqarnas* 24, *History and Ideology: Architectural Heritage of the "Lands of Rum"* (2007), 141-83; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*; Bosdoğan, 'Art and architecture in modern Turkey', 429.

⁴ The Byzantinist Charles Diehl comments that it was interesting to see an Ottoman Turk writing about the Byzantine art and history as the study of the Byzantine empire had been carried out before by Greeks, Russians, Germans, British and French: see Ch Diehl, 'Préface', in Djelal Essad [Celâl Esad Arseven], *Constantinople de Byzance* (Paris, 1909), i-iv. For early nineteenth-twentieth centuries studies by European architects and historians on Constantinople, see Crane, 'Recent literature on the history of Turkish architecture', 309; see also Ch. Texier, *Description de l'Asie Mineure, faite par ordre du gouvernement français, de 1833 à 1837, et publiée par le Ministère de instruction publique*, 3 vols. (Paris, 1839-49); and S. Pedone, 'Charles Félix –Marie Texier and the studies on the Ottoman architecture of Constantinople: a pioneering model', *Eurasian Studies* 10 (2012), 281-98; X. Hommaire de Hell, *Voyage en Turquie et en Perse exécuté par ordre du gouvernement français, pendant les années 1846, 1847 et 1848*, 2 vols. (Paris, 1854-60). F. Sarre, *Reise in Kleinasien* (Berlin, 1896); C. Gurlitt, *Die Baukunst Konstantinopels*, 2 vols. (Berlin, 1907); Max van Berchem, *Materiaux pour un Corpus Inscriptionum Arabicarum, Troisième Partie, Asie Mineure, Tome Premier, Siwas, Diwrigi* (Le Caire, 1910); R. M. Riefstahl, *Turkish Architecture in Southwestern Anatolia* (Cambridge, Mass., 1931); also Yildiz, 'A review of Byzantine Studies', 64. For the role of Arseven in the context of the Byzantine studies in the Ottoman empire, see P. Üre, *Byzantine heritage, archaeology, and politics between Russia and the Ottoman empire: Russian archaeological Institute in Constantinople (1894-1914)* (D. Phil, LSE, 2014), 84-90, 86-8. In the late 19th and early 20th centuries along Arseven's work there were historical works with nationalist tendencies that gave a negative portrayal of Byzantine empire in contrast with the post-conquest era when Ottoman sultans viewed themselves as representatives of the Roman-Byzantine tradition. On Istanbul's Byzantine heritage in the twentieth century, and the development of Byzantine studies in Turkey, see A. Dilsiz, 'The Byzantine inheritance of Istanbul: resource or burden? A study on the surviving ecclesiastical architecture of the historical peninsula within the framework of perception, preservation and research in the Turkish Republican period', MA thesis in Arts (Koç Univ., 2006), 14-32, 33-44; Yildiz, 'A review of Byzantine studies', 64ff. See also M. Ursinus, 'Byzantine history in late Ottoman Turkish historiography', *BMGS* 10(1986), 211-22; idem 'Der schlechteste Staat: Ahmed Midhat Efendi (1844-1912) on Byzantine Institutions', *BMGS* 11 (1987), 237-43; idem, 'From Süleyman Pasha to Mehmet Fuat Köprülü.

Ottoman architectural monuments and buildings providing also reconstruction drawings of them. In his works on the historical topography of Byzantine Istanbul, Arseven follows the tradition of scholars of the nineteenth and twentieth centuries, such as A. G. Paspatis, A. D. Mordtmann, van Millingen, J. Ebersolt, I. M. Nomidis, M. Ziya and R. Janin.⁵ Arseven's work *Constantinople, de Byzance á Stamboul* was published in French in 1909 and later translated in Ottoman Turkish and published in 1912/3 (Figure 1).⁶ It consists of three chapters: the first provides information on Byzantine history (*Bizans–Ma'lūmāt-ı Tārīhiyye*),⁷ the second on topography (*Bizans 'in Ahvāl-I Topoğrafyası*)⁸,

Roman and Byzantine history in late Ottoman Turkish historiography', *BMGS* 12 (1988), 305-14; and also D. Gülpınar, 'Anatolia's eternal destiny was sealed: Seljuks of Rum in the Turkish national (ist) imagination from the late Ottoman empire to the Republican era', in *Ottoman/Turkish visions of the nation, 1860-1950* (London, 2013), 106-34; N. Necipoğlu, 'The current state and future direction of Byzantine history in Turkey', in Ç. Kafesçioğlu and L. Thys-Şenokak (eds.), *Aptullah Kurah İçin Yazılar=Essays in honour of Aptullah Kurah* (Istanbul, 1999), 37-43; see also, H. Eissenstat, 'Modernization, imperial nationalism, and the ethnicization of confessional identity in the late Ottoman empire', in S. Berger, A. Miller, *Nationalizing empires* (Budapest and New York, 2015), 429-60

⁵ For an outline of the scholarship of architecture and topography of Byzantine Constantinople, see Dilsiz, 'The Byzantine inheritance', 4-13; see also J. Ebersolt, *Étude sur la topographie et les monuments de Constantinople* (Paris, 1909); A. D. Mordtmann, *Équisse topographique de Constantinople* (Lille, 1892); A. G. Paspatis, *Byzantinai meletai topographikai kai historikai* (Constantinople, 1877); M. Ziya, *Kariye Camii Şerifi* (Istanbul, 1326); idem, *Istanbul ve Boğaziçi. Bizans ve Osmanlı Medeniyetlerinin Ölümsüz Mirası* (Istanbul, 2004); A. van Millingen, *Byzantine churches in Constantinople: their history and architecture* (London, 1912); idem, *Byzantine Constantinople. The walls of the city and adjoining historical sites* (London, 1899).

⁶ Celâl Esad Arseven, *Constantinople de Byzance a Stamboul* (Paris, 1909), 151-5; Celâl Es'ad, *Eski İstanbul. Âbidât ve Mebânîsi Şehrin Te'şisinden Osmânlı Fethine Kadar* (Istanbul, 1328/1912). It was later translated in the present-day alphabet: see Celâl Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul. Âbidât ve Mebânîsi* (Istanbul, 1989). It was also translated in Russian Celal Esad, *Konstantinopol', Od Vizonti do Stambula*, tr. P. Bezobranov (Moscow, 1919). The work has a preface by the Byzantinist Charles Diehl, who praised Arseven for his successful undertaking of the study on Byzantine monuments in Constantinople. For an analysis of the *Eski İstanbul*, see Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 73-84. For a Turkish translation of Diehl's preface, see Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 78-9; see S. Eyice, 'Diehl, Charles', *DBIA* (Istanbul, 1994), iii, 48-9; Üre, *Byzantine heritage*, 86ff.. For A. D. Mordtmann's (d. 1879) and Halil Edhem Bey's (d. 1938) positive reactions and a Turkish translation of the excerpts, see Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 77, 79-80; see S. Eyice, 'Mordtmann, Andreas David (Oğul)', *DBIA* (Istanbul, 1994), v, 490-1. For Halil Edhem, see www.Biyografya.com/biyografi/17175

⁷ Celâl Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul*, 25-58; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 80. For an outline of Arseven's views on Byzantine history and art, his negative views about the

such as Constantinople's districts (*dā'ireler*)⁹, streets and squares (*sokaklar ve meydanlar*),¹⁰ surroundings (*Bizans Civārı*),¹¹ islands (*adalar*),¹² walls and towers (*surlar ve kuleler*)¹³, gates (*kapılar*),¹⁴ and the gates of the city walls of Haliç and Marmara (*Halic surlarının kapıları, Marmara surlarının kapıları*).¹⁵ The third chapter refers to Byzantine art and monuments (*Bizans sinā'atı ve mebānisi*),¹⁶ contains an outline of Byzantine art (*Bizans Sinā'atı*),¹⁷ and continues with information on Byzantine churches (*Bizans kiliseleri*),¹⁸ palaces (*Bizans sarayalari*),¹⁹ baths (*Bizans hamamları*),²⁰ monuments (*Abidāt*),²¹ aqueducts and cisterns (*Su Kemerleri ve Sarnıclar*),²² houses (*Bizans*

Byzantine emperors and society, his description of the conquest of Constantinople by the Turks, his acknowledgement of the influence of Byzantine art on European and Islamic traditions, the similarities he drew between European perceptions of Byzantine and Turkish art, see Üre, *Byzantine heritage*, 86-8, 90. For Arseven's similarities with M. Ziya's work on Byzantine art and architecture centred on their appropriation of Byzantine legacy *vis à vis* European rivals, see Üre, *Byzantine heritage*, 88-90.

⁸ Celāl Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul*, 59-107; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 80-2.

⁹ Celāl Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul*, 59-61; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 80.

¹⁰ Celāl Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul*, 61-7; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 80.

¹¹ Celāl Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul*, 67-80; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 80-1.

¹² Celāl Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul*, 81ff.; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 81.

¹³ Celāl Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul*, 92-9 ; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 81.

¹⁴ Celāl Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul*, 99-104; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 81-2.

¹⁵ Celāl Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul*, 104-7; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 82.

¹⁶ Celāl Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul*, 108-203; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 82-4.

For examples of Arseven's work on Byzantine monuments, see Z. A. Woodrow, *Imperial ideology in middle Byzantine court culture: the evidence of Constantine Porphyrogenitus's de ceremoniis* (PhD, Univ. Durham, 2001), 221; N. Özasan, 'From the shrine of Cosmidion to the shrine of Eyüp', *GRBS* 40 (1999), 379-99, 380. On Arseven's drawing of the Byzantine Mese, see M. Cerasi, 'The urban and architectural evolution of the Istanbul Divanyolu: urban aesthetics and ideology in Ottoman town building', *Muqarnas* 22 (2005), 189-232, 193n.15. On the Virgin's column, see İ. Aktuğ Kolay and S. Çelik, 'Ottoman stone acquisition in the mid-sixteenth century: the Süleymaniye complex in Istanbul', *Muqarnas* 23 (2006), 251-72, 264n.229; S. Bozdoğan and G. Necipoğlu 'Entangled discourses: scrutinizing Orientalist and nationalist legacies in the architectural historiography of the "Lands of Rum"', *Muqarnas* 24, 1-6, 3n.1. For Arseven's preparation of a cross-section of the Byzantine monument of the column of Constantine, and a reconstruction of the Mese, see P. Yoncacı Arslan, 'Christianizing the skyline: the appropriation of the pagan honorary column in early Constantinople' (D. Phil, UCLA, 2015), 105, n. 300, 294, 320.

¹⁷ Celāl Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul*, 108-14; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 82.

¹⁸ Celāl Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul*, 115-50 ; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 82-3.

¹⁹ Celāl Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul*, 150-73; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 83.

²⁰ Celāl Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul*, 173f. ; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 83.

²¹ Celāl Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul*, 175-84; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 83 .

²² Celāl Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul*, 186-8; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 83.

Evleri),²³ Byzantine buildings and their histories, and modern Byzantine monuments which are Islamic monuments (*Bizans Zamānına A'id Binālar ve Tārīhleri, Bizans Mebānīsının Mu'āsırı Olan Mebānī-i Islāmiyye*).²⁴ Arseven, in his writing architectural history, is a representative of the tradition of nationalist historiography and of the discourse of Turkish art and architecture's innovative and unique character, distinct from Islamic, Byzantine and eastern arts';²⁵ the didactic role of his works aiming 'to transform the material culture of Anatolia into a history of the Turks' has been stressed.²⁶ This is best illustrated in the first revised edition of Constantinople, titled *Türk Sanatı* (Turkish Art), published in Ottoman Turkish in 1928.²⁷ Arseven was

²³ Celal Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul*, 188-95; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 83; Akcan, *Architecture in translation*, 221; Bertram, *Imagining the Turkish house*, 85-6.

²⁴ Celal Esad Arseven, *Eski İstanbul*, 195-204; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 83.

²⁵ On the relationship of Republican and late Ottoman political ideologies to the discourse of art and architecture see the articles in the special issue of *Muqarnas* 24. On issues of ideology and cultural heritage in the early Republican period in Turkey, the notion of a clear breach with the empires whose territories it inherited and the idea of a new spirit of a modern Turkish nation exemplified in a paragraph from 'La Turquie Kemaliste' (No. 47: 1943, 38-9) cited in S. Bosdoğan, *Modernism and nation building: Turkish architectural culture in the early Republic* (Seattle, London, 2001), 67. For the lack of interest in its Byzantine heritage, and its impact on the development of the Byzantine field in Turkey, see Dilsiz, 'The Byzantine inheritance', 22ff., 41ff.. See also M. F. Köprülü, *Some observations on the influence of Byzantine institutions on Ottoman institutions* (Ankara, 1999) essay of 1931 where he denies any influence that Byzantine institutions had on Ottoman institutions: see H. Berktay, 'Der Aufstieg und die gegenwärtige Krise der nationalischen Geschichtsschreibung in der Türkei', *Periplus* 1 (1991), 102-25; for an opposite view, see N. Özdoğan, 'Türkiye Cumhuriyeti ve Arkeoloji: Siyasi Yönlendirmeler-Çelişkiler ve Gelişim Süreci', *Bilanço:1923-1998: Türkiye Cumhuriyeti'nin 75 Yılına Toplu Bakış Uluslararası Kongresi*, ed. Z. Rona (İstanbul; 1998), 193-204. See also S. Redford, 'What have you done for Anatolia today?': Islamic archaeology in the early years of the Turkish Republic', *Muqarnas* 24, 243-52, 244, n.13; Sh. Hamadeh 'Westernization, decadence, and the Turkish baroque: modern constructions of the eighteenth century', *Muqarnas* 24, 185-97; S. Bozdoğan, 'Reading Ottoman architecture through modernist lenses: nationalist historiography and the "New Architecture" in the early republic', *Muqarnas* 24, 199-221; Akcan, *Architecture in translation*, 221.

²⁶ Necipoğlu 'Creation of a national genius', *Muqarnas* 24, 161f., 171f.; Sh. Hamadeh 'Westernization, decadence, and the Turkish baroque: modern constructions of the eighteenth century', *Muqarnas* 24, 185-97; for issues of reconciliation of nationalist historiography with modernist practices, see Bozdoğan, 'Reading Ottoman architecture', *Muqarnas* 24, 201ff.; Akcan, *Architecture in translation*, 222.

²⁷ D. Kuban, 'Celal Esad Arseven ve Türk sanatı kavramı'[Celal Esad Arseven and the idea of Turkish art], *Mimarlık* lxxii (Ekim 1969), 18-20; for Arseven's different views of the Byzantine art and architecture in comparison with his earlier book

critical of orientalist historians who had classified Turkish art and architecture under a single Islamic category, ignoring their uniqueness.²⁸ His book *Eski Galata* sheds light on the history and topography of Pera-Galata and contains valuable illustrations of topographical locations.²⁹ Another work on Byzantine sites was his *Plan archéologique de Constantinople, Byzance et Stamboul* (1908/9).³⁰

As Ottoman modernization³¹ in late nineteenth century rapidly built a modern cultural conception, a generation of intellectuals came about able to interpret the intellectual output in both historical and aesthetical perspectives. The issue of ancient works brought into the agenda by Münif Paşa (d. 1910)³² and his circle had soon developed into an archaeological collection thanks to the efforts of Fethi Ahmed Paşa (d. 1858), the minister of war. This important enterprise was protected and maintained under *Müze-i Hümayûn* (The imperial museum) with the support of Osman Hamdi Bey (d. 1910),³³ Halil Edhem Bey (d. 1938)³⁴ and Ismail Ghalib Bey (d. 1895)³⁵ while constituting a solid step towards a modern consciousness which was to shed light on Turkish art within the framework of world art history.³⁶ The latest generation of intellectuals, who could challenge the Western mentality of evaluating

Constantinople, de Byzance á Stamboul, see the Yildiz, ‘A review of Byzantine studies’, 65-6.

²⁸ Yildiz, ‘A review of Byzantine studies’, 65f.; Hamadeh ‘Westernization, decadence’; Bozdoğan, ‘Reading Ottoman architecture’, 203f.; idem, *Modernizm ve Ulusun İnşası: Erken Cumhuriyet Türkiyesi’nde Mimari Kültür* (Istanbul, 2002), 262-5.

²⁹ Celâl Esad Arseven, *Eski Galata ve Binaları* (Istanbul, 1989); A. Mestyan, ‘A garden with mellow fruits of refinement’ Music theatres and cultural politics in Cairo and Istanbul, 1867-1892 (D. Phil Central European Uni., Budapest, 2011), 82n.1, 83n.7; for an analysis, see Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 84-8; B. B. Erdoğan, *Galata Kent Surları ve Koruma Önerileri* (Thesis, Istanbul Teknik Üniversitesi, 2011).

³⁰ Arseven, Celal Esad, *Plan archéologique de Constantinople, Byzance et Stamboul* (Istanbul, 1908/9).

³¹ Üre, *Byzantine heritage*, 93,n.242.

³² S. Inceoglu, ‘Tanzimat’ta Bir Düşünür ve Bürokrat: Münif Paşa ve İktisat Tasavvuru’, *Divan İlmi Araştırmalar Dergisi* (2005/2), sy. 19, 231-64.

³³ Bloom, Blair (eds.), *The Grove Encyclopedia*, I, index, 496; www.istanbularkeoloji.gov.tr/osman_hamdi_bey; Üre, *Byzantine heritage*, 109ff.

³⁴ Bloom, Blair (eds.), *The Grove Encyclopedia*, 49-50.

³⁵ Bloom, Blair (eds.), *The Grove Encyclopedia*, 498.

³⁶ N. Altinyildiz ‘The architectural heritage of Istanbul and the ideology of preservation’, *Muqarnas* 24, 281-305. For the Ottoman interest in ancient monuments seen in the context of modernisation process as part of the *Tanzimat* period reforms, see Üre, *Byzantine heritage*, 99. For the function and development of archaeology in the Ottoman empire, and the objective of the founders of the imperial museum, see Üre, *Byzantine heritage*, 93ff., 109ff., 123-4; see also W. Shaw, ‘Museums and narratives of display from the Ottoman empire to the Turkish Republic’, *Muqarnas* 24, 253-79,

Turkish art as a mere copy of Islamic civilization and could insist on the importance of differences as well as similarities in the creation of a unique cultural dynamic, were doubtlessly led by Mehmed Raif (d. 1916 or 1917 or 1919)³⁷, Mehmed Ziya (Gökalp) (d. 1924)³⁸ and Celâl Esad Arseven.

Influenced to a large extent by the encyclopedist approach of the previous generation, Celâl Esad's interest in art was wide ranging. His works on art, literature, theatre, music, film, urban development, architecture and art history demonstrates the huge range of his interests. Although his individual works, being produced within such a wide range, could be regarded as vulgarization, it can not be denied that through such examples as he produced he showed the way and provided material for subsequent analytical research. On the other hand, Celâl Esad is not exactly a vulgarizer in the whole sense. He is a professional especially when it comes to urban monographies and decorative arts. A typical Istanbul writer, the fundamental achievement of Celâl Esad lies in having aroused the art taste of a society which was caught in tight patterns.³⁹

Celâl Esad Arseven⁴⁰ was born in Beşiktaş in 1875. His mother was Fatma Suzidil Hanım, daughter of Sakızlı Mustafa Efendi; his father was the well-known Tanzimat (1839-76)⁴¹ dignitary Sadrazam Ahmed Esad

³⁷ S. Eyice, 'Mehmed Ra'if Bey', *Dünden Bugüne İstanbul Ansiklopedisi*, v, 362-3; D. Gürpınar, *The Palgrave Macmillan Ottoman/Turkish visions of the nation, 1860-1950* (NY, 2013), index.

³⁸ G. H. Herb, D. H. Kaplan, *Nations and nationalism: a global historical overview*, vol. 1, 1770 to 1880 (California, 2008), 766.

³⁹ Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 74.

⁴⁰ Behçet Ünsal, 'Celâl Esad Hoca', *Arkitekt* 41. 345 (1972), 33; Kickingereeder, 'Celâl Esad Arseven's Memoirs', 37ff., n.3.

⁴¹ S. J. Shaw & E. K. Shaw, *History of the Ottoman empire and modern Turkey*, vol. ii: *Reform, revolution, and republic: the rise of modern Turkey, 1808-1975* (Cambridge, 1977); Üre, *Byzantine heritage*, 98 defines the Tanzimat period as 'a series of top-down modernising reforms carried out by a new generation of bureaucrats, which restructured the Ottoman empire and accelerated the process of Westernization'; see A. Ersoy, 'Architecture and the search for Ottoman origins in the Tanzimat period', *Muqarnas* 24, 117-39.

Paşa (1828-75).⁴² Upon the premature death of his father, he was raised by his paternal uncle Kâzım Paşa (1839-1936).⁴³

Life in the mansion in Beşiktaş occupies a crucial part of Celâl Esad's childhood. A nineteenth century mansion is a living space in which the cultural relations between modern knowledge, skills and objects brought into our social life through the Westernization movement⁴⁴ are reflected into practice; it is a scale of values establishing a bond between the individual and the world outside. The upper level Ottoman family has found its identity in this creative post-Tanzimat environment; points of conflict and conciliation among family members have shaped the modern life style at the mansion. Celâl Esad meets the art of painting within the framework provided by such an environment.⁴⁵ The initial meeting turns Arseven's attention to fine arts even during his pre-school years as well as sowing the seeds for future uneasiness caused by the conflict with the future his family had in mind for him.

In 1881 he starts primary school at Beşiktaş Taş Mektep. The primary school right across the palace kitchens at Akaretler was an institution which like others of its kind provided an education in the old, in other words traditional, way called '*usul-i-atîka*'⁴⁶; the windows were iron-

⁴² *Vak'a Nüvis Ahmed Lütfi Efend Tarihi* (Ankara, 1988), 17-22; *Ruznâme-I Ceride-I Havâdis*, no. 2099 (19 Zilhicce 1289), no. 2758 (20 Rebiü'l-evvel 1292), no. 2943 (2 Zilkade 1292); S. Eyice, 'Celâl Esad Arseven. 1875-1971', *Bellekten* xxxvi (1972), 173-202, 175; Ahmed Midhat, *Menfâ* (Istanbul, 1293), 69; Abdurrahman şeref, *Tarih Musahâbeleri* (Istanbul, 1340), 182; Ebüzziya Tevfik, *Yeni Osmanlılar Tarihi* (Istanbul, 1973), 205-6; F. Abdullah Tansel, *Namık Kemal'in Hususi Mektupları* (Ankara, 1967), 387; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 73

⁴³ Kickingereeder, 'Celâl Esad Arseven's Memoirs', 38, 43; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 73.

⁴⁴ For Arseven's concepts of 'decadence' and 'degeneration' equated with the foreign (European and 'Western') contamination of Ottoman architectural forms in his writings, see Hamadeh 'Westernization, decadence', *Muqarnas* 24; see also A. Borie, 'The modernisation of architecture', *Rassegna* 72 (Istanbul, Constantinople, Byzantium) (1997), 62-9; for the concept of Westernization, see Hamadeh 'Westernization, decadence', 193-4; A. Ö. Evin, 'The Tulip Age and Definitions of Westernization' in *Türkiye'nin Sosyal ve Ekonomik Tarihi (1071-1920)*, eds. O. Okyar, H. İnalçık (Ankara, 1980), 131-43 at 139; and R. Murphey, 'Westernisation in the eighteenth-century Ottoman empire: how far, how fast?', *BMGS* 23 (1999), 116-39.

⁴⁵ Celâl Esad Arseven, 'Türk Resim Sanatında Yetmiş Yıllık Hayatım', *Yeni İstanbul*, no. 1901 (4 Mart 1955). For this autobiographical text published in 1955, see Kickingereeder, 'Celâl Esad Arseven's Mempoirs', 37ff. Together with Arseven's second autobiography *Yıldız Sarayı'ndan Mütareke'ye Kadar Hatıralarım* it was republished in 1993 with the title *Celâl Esad Arseven, Sanat ve Siyaset Hatıralarım* (Istanbul, 1993); Işın, 'Sunuş', in *Celâl Esad Arseven, Sanat ve Siyaset Hatıralarım*, 9-24

⁴⁶ Bayram Kodaman, *Abdülhamid Devri Eğitim Sistemi* (Istanbul, 1980), 116; Özgönül Aksoy, *Osmanlı Devri İstanbul Sıbyan Mektepleri Üzerine Bir İnceleme* (Istanbul,

barred and the place looked like *medrese* cells. Frequenting this school, in which the educational aim was limited to the reading of the Koran only for a short while,⁴⁷ Celâl Esad passed on to *Beşiktaş İbtidaisi* which offered modern education.⁴⁸ He graduates in 1884 and in 1885 he is enrolled to *Galatasaray Sultanisi* as a boarding student.⁴⁹ Having already had French lessons from an elderly governess his father Esad Paşa had brought over from France, Celâl Esad finds an opportunity to develop his language skills for another year at *Galatasaray*. However, his uncle Kâzım Paşa's wish is to raise him as a perfect soldier in keeping with the family tradition; thus Celâl Esad finds himself obliged to quit school. In 1885/6 he enters *Beşiktaş Rüşdiye-I Askeriyyesi* (military school).⁵⁰ From this day on, he would continuously come into conflict with the ideal soldier identity his family projected for him, thus falter to find his true identity between the family heritage which treasures above all the passion for the uniform and the universal influence of Western taste for art. Taking into consideration the year he spent at *Galatasaray*, he is directly transferred to second grade at the *Rüşdiye*. Here he is introduced to oil painting for the first time. Young graduates of *Mühendishane* (academy of engineering) and *Mekteb-I Harbiyye* (military academy)⁵¹ have been giving art lessons at the *Rüşdiye*, however these lessons did not go beyond simple sketches. Nevertheless, it was at *Beşiktaş Rüşdiye-I Askeriyyesi* where Celâl Esad received his basic knowledge on art. Right after he graduates in 1889, with a sudden decision he enrolls himself in *Mekteb-I Mülkiyye*⁵² (academy for civil servants) instead of *Harbiyye*. For the youth of the time, enrolment in *Mülkiyye* was in a way the first step into the opposition against Abdülhamid.⁵³ Together with his classmates Rıza Tevfik (d. 1949)⁵⁴ (the philosopher) and Selim Sırrı

1968); Reşad Ekrem Koçu, 'Sıbyan Mektepleri', *Hayat Tarih Mecmuası*, Yıl 2, C.1, no. 2 (Mart 1966), 24-8.

⁴⁷ A. Kemal, *Ömrüm* (Istanbul, 1985), 17.

⁴⁸ *Yeni İstanbul*, no. 1902 (5 Mart 1955); Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 73

⁴⁹ Eyice, 'Celâl Esad Arseven', 175; *Yeni İstanbul*, no. 1903 (6 Mart 1955); Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 73.

⁵⁰ Kickingereder, 'Celâl Esad Arseven's Memoirs', 38, n.6; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 73; Garpınar, *Ottoman imperial diplomacy*, 123-4.

⁵¹ Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 73.

⁵² Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 73; Kickingereder, 'Celâl Esad Arseven's Memoirs', 38, n.7.

⁵³ Celâl Esad Arseven, 'Yıldız Sarayından Mütareke'ye Kedar Celâl Esad Arseven'in Hatıraları', *Dünya*, no. 2625 (20 Ocak, 1960). For this autobiographical text published in 1960, see Kickingereder, 'Celâl Esad Arseven's Memoirs', 37ff.

⁵⁴ Th. Zarcone, *Mystiques, philosophes et frans-maçons en Islam: Rıza Tevfik, penseur Ottoman (1868-1949)* (Paris, 1993).

(Tarcan) (d. 1956)⁵⁵, he follows the *Jön Türk* (Young Turks) movement as far as the political climate allows.⁵⁶ The close interest he has towards the problems of his country and the world has also turned Arseven into an amateur publisher. He clandestinely distributes among his school mates the caricature magazine *Kahkaha* (laughter) which he publishes at home using a kind of lithography technique (*şapirografi*)⁵⁷. During these years, Celâl Esad followed the path of those Ottoman intellectuals who made their first steps into the authorial career by translating popular articles. His translations of many *Muhasebe-I fenniyye* (accounts of sciences), which could perhaps be regarded the only kind of writing able to pass the censorship of the era, and his sending these translations to Ahmed Midhad, owner of the newspaper *İkdam*, demonstrate his sympathy with Ottoman encyclopedism. This sympathy would gradually get systematized and determine the general characteristics of his works on art history. Again in the years he spent at *Mülkiyye*, Celâl Esad was to find a new area of interest which brought together art and technical matters: photography. The exhilaration of seeing daily life through the lens has affected him at least as deeply as painting.⁵⁸ However, painting was not favoured at *Mülkiyye* and the students who painted were a matter of complaint. Celâl Esad argued with the academy director Abdurrahman Şeref Bey (d. 1925), a famous historian, on this matter and when nothing comes out of the argument the idea of passing on to *Sanayi-I Nefise Mektebi* (academy of fine arts) spontaneously develops.⁵⁹ The majority of the students at *Sanayi-I Nefise Mektebi*, operating under the *Tokapı Sarayı Asar-I Şarkiyeye Müzesi* (Topkapı palace museum for eastern works of art), consisted of Greeks (Rum) and Armenians, with only three Turkish students: İsmail Hakkı Altunbezer, one of the most famous of latest calligraphers; painter Galib Bey and İhsan Bey, one of the first Turkish sculptors. A Turkish youth's being interested in art, especially in painting, however, was regarded odd in a manner which actually contradicted the ideals of Ottoman modernization. This manner is well reflected in Kâzım Paşa's words to Celâl Esad : 'How can the son of Sadr-I Azam Esad Paşa become a painter? Would this befit our family

⁵⁵ F. Rahman, *Islam and modernity: transformation of an intellectual tradition* (Chicago and London, 1982), 61.

⁵⁶ Üre, *Byzantine heritage*, 120ff.

⁵⁷ *Yeni İstanbul*, no. 1904 (7 Mart 1955); *Dünya*, no. 2633 (28 Ocak 1960).

⁵⁸ *Yeni İstanbul* no.1904 (7 Mart 1955).

⁵⁹ *Yeni İstanbul*, no.1905 (8 Mart 1955); *Dünya*, no. 2625 (20 Ocak, 1960); Kickingereder, 'Celâl Esad Arseven's Memoirs', 38, n.8; S. A. Somel, *The modernization of public education in the Ottoman empire, 1838-1908, Islamization, autocracy and discipline* (Leiden, 2001), 52; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 73.

honor? Does this not run all your education to waste? You should be a great man serving this state, this nation, just like your father. Let's make you a scribe to *Bâb-I Alî*. Or if you wish we can put you in *Harbiyye*, you would come out as an officer and become a *paşa* some day'.⁶⁰ Though Celâl Esad resists the pressure of his family, at some point he has to submit to the will of Abdülhamid II (d. 1918) and enrolls in the 'Zadegân' class of *Mekteb-I Harbiyye* in 1891.⁶¹ In this special class which consists of sons of high ranking dignitaries (*paşas*) he finds a convenient artistic environment in which he could develop himself more as a painter rather than a soldier. The large hall at the *Hünkar* department of the academy has been transformed into a painting studio. Students practiced under the tutorship of the leading names of Turkish art such as Şeker Ahmed Paşa and Üskünderli Hoca Ali Rıza.⁶² Having found the opportunity to develop his oil painting technique at *Harbiyye*, Celâl Esad is influenced especially by Hoca Ali Rıza and this influence prepares the grounds for the establishment of a fruitful friendship based on their work in the years to come.⁶³ The years at *Harbiyye* have been a period of identity building for Celâl Esad. When the Turkish-Greek war breaks out, he graduates from the *Harbiyye* as *Mülâzım-I sâni* (second lieutenant), without finishing his last year, and is appointed to Yıldız Palace as personal aide-de-camp to Abdülhamid.⁶⁴

The years after his graduation constitute a period of creativity in which Celâl Esad dedicated himself entirely to art. His exhibition in Beyoğlu and his writings on art published in *Malûmat* on one hand, and on the other hand his acquaintance with and taking lessons from the famous painter [Fausto] Zonaro (d.1929) demonstrate his determination on developing himself as a painter.⁶⁵ It is also during this period that he finds an opportunity to work with a nude model, which he never has before, at the night studio three painters, namely *Sanayi-I Nefise* students Paulidis, Basmacidis and Alektoridis, have opened at Beyoğlu Parmakkapı. Celâl Esad also made his first journey to Europe after graduating. He went to Vienna, Paris and Berlin. In Berlin, he frequents

⁶⁰ *Yeni İstanbul*, no.1905 (8 Mart 1955).

⁶¹ Kickingereder, 'Celâl Esad Arseven's Memoirs', 38, n. 9.

⁶² Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 73-4

⁶³ Kickingereder, 'Celâl Esad Arseven's Memoirs', 41 ,n.34; Shaw, *Ottoman painting*, 33..

⁶⁴ Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 74.

⁶⁵ Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 74; O. Öndeş, E. Makzume, *Fausto Zonaro, Ottoman court painter* (Istanbul, 2003).

a zincography studio together with the calligrapher İsmail Hakkı Bey (d. 1946)⁶⁶ and learns modern photoengraving techniques.⁶⁷

In the years between 1895-1903, Celâl Esad published a series of books on painting techniques. The first book under the series 'Resim Kütübhanesi' (Painting library) is *Resim Dersleri* (art lessons), was published in 1313/1895.⁶⁸ The second book is *Ressam ve Mimarlara Mahsûs Menâzır* (Perspectives for painters and architects) dated 1316/1899. The third is *Ressamlara Rehber* (Guide for painters) dated 1318/1901 and the last work of the series is *Renkler, Renkli Resimler ve Yağlıboya* (Colors, paintings and oil paint) published in 1319/1903. *Fotoğrafya* (Photography), a result of his interest in photography, published in 1316/1899 is another product of this period.

We see the painter and publisher Celâl Esad shifting his interest toward history of art and architecture after 1903. On the suggestion of Pangalo, an American he met in 1903, he prepares a model for the Turkish pavilion to be built in an international exhibition in St. Louise. His research on Byzantine and Ottoman Istanbul for his project prepares the ground work for *Constantinople, De Byzance à Stamboul*, a book to be published by Renouard-H. Laurens in Paris in 1909. The book stimulates great interest and finds its place as a reference within the literature on Byzantine Istanbul.⁶⁹ Celâl Esad prepares the project on old Istanbul neighbourhoods and Kapalıçarşı in the course of one month, however he is not allowed to go to the United States. The project finds praise in the press.⁷⁰ Among his pre-II. *Meşrutiyet* (constitutional period) works, the project for Fehim Paşa's (d. 1908), one of Abdülhamid's favorites, baroque mansion with 30 rooms at the ridges of Ihlamur and his 1323/1907 dated *Yapı Malzemesi* (construction material) are particularly worth noting. During this period, Celâl Esad also shows

⁶⁶ M. U. Derman, *Letters in gold. Ottoman calligraphy from the Sakip Sabanci Collection, Istanbul* (New York, 1998), 160.

⁶⁷ *Yeni Istanbul*, no. 1908 (11 Mart 1955); Kickingereeder, 'Celâl Esad Arseven's Memoirs', 38, n.12.

⁶⁸ Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 74.

⁶⁹ R. Janin, *Constantinople Byzantine. Développement urbain et repertoire topographique* (Paris, 1950), xxiii. Janin cites Arseven's work in his bibliography among the *ouvrages de vulgarisation* (Paris, 1964), xxxiv. In his outline of the plans used in scholarship on Byzantine Constantinople he comments that Arseven follows E. M. Antoniadis, *Ekphrasis tes Agias Sofias*, 1907, who introduced improvements taking into consideration the scientific works of his contemporaries, but he says that the transcription of the Byzantine names leaves much to be desired; see Janin, *Constantinople Byzantine*, xxxv.

⁷⁰ *World's fair bulletin*, no. 9 (July 1903); Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 74.

his talent for literature with his book *Sevda Çağı* (era of love) (1319/1903).

With the proclamation of II. *Meşrutiyet* a flood of publications cover the market, Celâl Esad and his friend Salâh Cimcoz join the flood with the newspaper *Kalem* (Pen).⁷¹ Young and famous artists gathered around *Kalem*, ‘a political and satirical’ publication as Celâl Esad calls it, including well-known names such as Cenab Şahabettin (d. 1934), Refik Halit (d. 1965) and Hüseyin Suad (d. 1942)⁷². The caricatures, on the other hand, are made by the famous caricaturist Cem (d. 1950) and Celâl Esad. When the first issue of *Kalem* appears on August 21, 1324, Celâl Esad had not yet resigned from his duty as an officer.⁷³

After resigning from the military he goes to Paris. He settles in Madame Sauvage’s guesthouse on Victor Hugo Avenue and steps in the intensive life of Parisian artistic circles. He commissions caricatures to D’ Ostaya, a painter he met there, to be published in *Kalem*.⁷⁴ Meanwhile, inspired by the fashion painter Malatier, he does research on Old Turkish costumes. During these years he also publishes *Plan Archéologique de Constantinople*, an archaeological map of Istanbul containing both Byzantine and the Ottoman periods.⁷⁵

Within the atmosphere of freedom of 1908, Celâl Esad brings to life his hitherto unrealized theatre project together with his friend Salâh Cimcoz. Having planned to write the script for Selim-I Salis long before 1908, Celâl Esad thought of escaping from Abdülhamid’s despotism and having the play performed in Paris.⁷⁶ However, such an escape never happens. The work operates around the historical relation between Ottoman modernization, Napoleonic France and the reforms of Selim III (d. 1808). The general subject matter of the play belonged to Celâl Esad, Salâh Cimcoz had filled in the historical details. The play has been put on

⁷¹ Kickingereeder, ‘Celâl Esad Arseven’s Memoirs’, 38, n.13; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 76-80; Diehl, ‘Préface’, I; T. Heizelmann, *Die Balkankrise in der osmanischen Karikatur: Die Satirezeitschriften Karagöz, Kalem, und Cem, 1908-1914* (Istanbul, 1999), 76-7.

⁷² S. N. Ergun, *Cenab Şehabettin, Hayatı ve Eserleri* (Istanbul, 1934); E. Köroğlu, *Ottoman propaganda and Turkish identity: literature in Turkey during world war I* (London, 2007); B. Altuniş Gürsoy, *Hüseyin Suad Yalçın ve eserleri* (Ankara, 2001).

⁷³ Eyice, ‘Celâl Esad Arseven’, 176; *Dünya*, no. 2633 (28 Ocak 1960).

⁷⁴ *Yeni İstanbul*, no.1908 (11 Mart 1955).

⁷⁵ Eyice, ‘Celâl Esad Arseven’, 185; S. Eyice, ‘İstanbul’un Ortadan Kalkan Bazı Tarihi Eserleri’, *Tarih Enstitüsü Dergisi* (Prof. Tayyib Gökbilgin Hâtırâ sayısı), 12 (1981-2), 857.

⁷⁶ Lütfi Ay, ‘Yarı Asır Sonra Yeniden Sahneye Çıkan III. Selim Hakkında Celâl Esad Arseven.İle Bir Konuşma’, *Vatan*, 5691 (25 Mart 1957); Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 74.

stage by Minakyan's *Osmanlı Dram Kumpanyası at Beyoğlu Varyete Tiyatrosu* on September 6, 1910.⁷⁷

In 1912, Celâl Esad brings his traits as artist and researcher together with the administrative tasks he undertakes within bureaucracy and produces work on urban administration. His first active job at the Municipality was at the *Tahrir-i Musakkafat Reisliği* (department of *waqf* income derived from house property).⁷⁸ He assumes an influential role within the new structure with the appointment of Mayor Cemil Paşa as *Istanbul Şehremini* (mayor) and vice governor on August 21, 1912, on the order of *İttihat ve Terakki*. In the same year, he publishes the original of *Constantinople, De Byzance à Stamboul*, which had been published in France in 1909, under the name *Eski İstanbul. Âbidat ve Mebanisi. Şehrin Tesisinden Osmanlı Fethine Kadar* (Old Istanbul. Monuments and foundations. From the foundation of the city to the Ottoman conquest). Again in the same year, he publishes an extended edition of his *Istilahat-I Mimariyye* (Architectural Terms).⁷⁹ In 1913, he is appointed as assistant to *Şehremaneti Umur-I Fenniyye ve İstatistik Müdürlüğü* (Municipality Department of Technological matters and Statistics).⁸⁰

In 1913, disagreements between the Mayor Cemil Paşa and Celâl Esad on urban administration and urban planning come to the surface. Cemil Paşa's approach to the development lies more in favour of parks and gardens financed by the municipality budget, whereas Celâl Esad argues for the immediate need to deal with the inefficient infrastructure of the city.⁸¹ He cannot get along with Mr. Auric, whom Cemil Paşa appointed

⁷⁷ Metin And, *Meşrutiyet Döneminde Türk Tiyatrosu (1908-1923)* (Ankara, 1971), 204-6; Lütfi Ay, 'Yarı Asır Sonra Yeniden Sahneye Çıkan III', 4; Müfid Ratib, 'Selim-I Sâlis', *Servet-i Fünûn* C.40, no. 1016 (Teşrin-i evvel 1326); Refik Ahmet Sevengil, *Meşrutiyet Tiyatrosu* (İstanbul, 1968), 37-45; Özdemir Nutku, *Darülbeyazıt'ın Elli Yılı (Darülbeyazıt'den şehir Tiyatrosu'na)* (Ankara, 1969), 14.

⁷⁸ Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 74.

⁷⁹ [Arseven], Celâl Esad, *Istilahât-I Mimariye* (İstanbul, 1908); for an outline of the work, see Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 122; D. Mazlum, 'Öncü Bir Mimarlık Sözlüğü: Celâl Esad Arseven'in İstilahât-ı-Mimariye'si', *Sanat Tarihi Defterleri* 9 (İstanbul, 2005), 9-32; see also another dictionary Arseven wrote: *Istilahât-ı İlmiye Encümeni Tarafından Sanayi-I Nefisede Mevcut Kelimât ve Tabirât İçin Vaz 'u Tedvini Tensib Olunan İstilahât Mecmuasıdır* (İstanbul, 1914); and for a modern Turkish translation, see *Güzel Sanatlar Terimleri Alanında Öncü Bir Çalışma Sanâyi'-i Neftise İstilahât-ı Mecmuası* (İstanbul, 2012); for this work, see Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 123-34.

⁸⁰ C. Topuzlu, *İstibdat- Meşrutiyet-Cumhuriyet Devirlerinde 80 Yıllık Hâtuvalarım* (İstanbul, 1951), 117; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 74.

⁸¹ *Dünya* 2638 (2 Şubat 1960); Topuzlu, *İstibdat- Meşrutiyet-Cumhuriyet*, 132-4; Altinyıldız, 'The architectural heritage of Istanbul', *Muqarnas* 24, 285; Özaslan, *Historic*

as head of the Technology Commission, and is finally appointed as director to the department of Kadıköy Municipality. In 1913, the second of his works on Istanbul *Eski Galata ve Binaları* (Old Galata and its buildings) is published. The work was initially printed as a series in *Servet-i Fünun* starting from the 1159th issue on and then compiled and published as a book in the same year.

Focusing primarily on the infrastructure problems in regards to the urban development of Istanbul, Celâl Esad makes a journey to Europe with Cemil Paşa on the eve of World War I. On this expedition designed to explore urban trends, he takes Cemil Paşa on a rowboat ride along the sewers of Paris to prove his point about the importance of the infrastructure problems he stresses.⁸²

As World War I rapidly advances, Celâl Esad's operations as mayor of Kadıköy continue incessantly. Kadıköy municipality, which operated at a wooden mansion in Çarıkçı neighbourhood is carried to its present location at the pier square (present-being the time when this article was written). The square is re-arranged and the sporadic settlement between the pier and the market is removed. By his own initiative, he also decorates the walls of the municipality building with panels commissioned to famous artists.⁸³ The third work concerning his research on Istanbul, *Kadıköy Hakkında Tedkikât-ı Belediye* (Municipal examinations on Kadıköy) is a concrete product of his efforts of the period. Celâl Esad demonstrated his expertise in municipal administration in the three works, primarily related to administrative regulations, published in 1915-6: *Belediyelerde Evrakın Kayd ve Tasnifi Nasıl Olmalıdır* (Recording and classification of documents in municipalities) (1331/1915); *Belediyelerde İnşaatın Emâneten İdaresi* (Administration of construction in trust for municipalities) (1331/1915); *Belediyeler ve Teşkilâtı* (Municipalities and organization) (1331/1916). In 1917, he is elected as a member of *Muhafaza-ı Abidat Encümeni* (Committee for the preservation of monuments) founded under the Istanbul Archaeological Museum.⁸⁴

One of the main issues occupying the agenda of Ottoman foreign affairs during the war years was the organization of propaganda activity

urban fabric, 96; for background information, see P. Pinon, 'Urban transformation between the 18th and 19th centuries', *Rassegna*, 53-61.

⁸² *Dünya*, no. 2639 (3 Şubat 1960).

⁸³ N. Berk, *Istanbul Resim ve Heykel Müzesi* (Istanbul, 1972), 20; *Yeni İstanbul* 1910 (13 Mart 1955).

⁸⁴ Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 74; for an outline of the architectural preservation of Byzantine heritage in the context of urban development policies in twentieth century Istanbul, see Dilsiz, 'The Byzantine inheritance', 14-21.

to present the Turks as a modern nation in the eyes of the allied forces and thus secure foreign aid. The Intelligence Department at the Ministry of War, taking initiative in this, requested a report from Celâl Esad by the suggestion of its director Miralay (Colonel) Seyfi Bey. In this report, Celâl Esad suggests organizing art exhibitions and concerts in the capital cities of the allied forces, these would demonstrate the dimension of Ottoman modernization⁸⁵. The report is accepted and preparations begin. First, the conductor of the Private Chamber (*Mabeyn-i Hümayûn*) orchestra Zeki Bey is asked to establish an orchestra of eighty musicians. With a repertoire of selected works of Beethoven, Wagner, Schubert and Haydn the orchestra performs its first rehearsal at Gümüşsuyu Barracks. After a successful European tour organized in the name of *Salib-i Ahmer* (Red Cross), the orchestra returns home in 1918.⁸⁶ Upon Seyfi Bey's demand for paintings with primarily military subject-matter, painting activity commences at the huge studio built in Şişli.⁸⁷ Among the painters taking part in the project are the famous names of Turkish painting: Çallı İbrahim, Feyhaman, Namık İsmail, Hikmet Onat, Sami Yetik and Ali Sami. The exhibition is first launched in Beyoğlu,⁸⁸ and then sent to Vienna and Berlin with Celâl Esad presiding.⁸⁹

During the years of war, Celâl Esad also served as a member of the managing board of *Darülbedayi* (city theatre in Istanbul).⁹⁰ After the French theatre expert Antoine left his job at *Darülbedayi*, which was still in the foundation phase, the administrative void was filled with the 'Hey'et-i İdâre' (Administrative Committee) established by the initiative of mayor İsmet Bey. Celâl Esad served in this committee together with Salâh Cimcoz, İbnürrefik Ahmed Nuri, Cenab Şehabeddin and Hüseyin Suad.⁹¹ The first committee meeting was realised on April 23, 1331, at Letafet Apartments in Şehzadebaşı; İsmail Cenani was elected president

⁸⁵ Bozdoğan, 'Reading Ottoman architecture'.

⁸⁶ M. R. Gazimihal, *Türk Askerî Muzikaları Tarihi* (Istanbul, 1955), 138; *Dünya*, no.2642 (6 Şubat 1960); Kickingereder, 'Celâl Esad Arseven's Memoirs', 38,n.14; Heizelmann, *Die Balkankrise*, 77.

⁸⁷ *Yeni İstanbul* 1910 (13 Mart 1955); *Dünya*, no. 2642 (6 Şubat 1960).

⁸⁸ Halil Edhem, *Elvâh-i Naksiyye Koleksiyonu* (Istanbul, 1340), 34

⁸⁹ Eyice, 176; *Dünya*, no.2643 (7 Şubat 1960); Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 74; for the building of a nationalist character of music in the early republican era in Turkey, see N. Sinan Turan, B. Işıktaş, 'The deadlock of nation-state: the problem of nationalisation of music during the early Republican era in Turkey', *Rast Müzikoloji Dergisi*, Cilt IV, Sayı 1 (2016), 1076-92, 1079.

⁹⁰ N. Miraç Ümit, Celal Esad Arseven, 'Bugunku Sahne, *Hayat Mecmuası*, C.I, S.19, Ankara (7 Nisan 1927), 369-371 (Osmanlıcadan Çeviri) *Art Sanat* 2 (2014), 329-35.

⁹¹ Özdemir Nutku, *Darülbedayi'nin*, 27.

and Celâl Esad secretary.⁹² Towards the end of the war, Celâl Esad, keeping his membership of the committee, wrote an operetta named Şaban.⁹³ The music of the work, based on Russian polyphonic music and adorned with motifs from Turkish composers like Dede Efendi and Itri, was composed by Viktor Radeglia, a master at *Darülbedayi*. This operetta was performed at Volksoper theatre in Vienna with the staging of Herr von Mainau.⁹⁴ The work was received with so much interest among the intellectuals that the same Halide Edib, too, wrote a libretto, namely *Kenan Çobanları* (Shepherds of Canaan), which was then composed by Vedi Sabra.⁹⁵ A committee was formed for organizing the performance of this opera; based on his expertise in this field Celâl Esad was included in the committee together with Halide Edib herself, Falih Rifkî and Muhsin Ertuğrul; and he undertook to have the scenery be produced in Vienna.

Following painting, art history, music and theatre, another field of art Celâl Esad showed interest in during the years of truce was film. During the occupation of Istanbul, he meets the photographer Kenan Reşid in Berlin and upon his request writes the script *Die Tote Wacht*. With the participation of Neemeddin Molla and İsmail Hakkı Bey-the consul at München- he founds *Trans-Orient Film* company for the production of the film. Featuring German actors, *Die Tote Wacht* does not meet enough interest in the presence of American productions which have invaded post-war Europe.⁹⁶

Having been out of the country during the War of Independence, Celâl Esad returns to Istanbul when war is over. Upon the invitation of Hamdullah Suphi, vice minister of education, he is appointed as History of architecture teacher at *Sanayi-I Nefise Mektebi*.⁹⁷

Leaving aside *Büyük Yarın* (The Great Tomorrow), a play in three acts, written in 1923, and *Notlar ve Kütüphanelere Dair Usul-I Tasnif* (Classification methods for libraries and notes) published the year after, during the first years of the Republic⁹⁸ his area of interest lay in architectural history and urban development. In 1923, he works as

⁹² Refik Ahmet Sevengil, *Yakın Çağlarda Türk Tiyatrosu* (Istanbul, 1934), 99.

⁹³ *Dünya* no.2639 (3 Şubat 1960), no. 2643 (7 Şubat 1960); Gazimihal, *Türk Askerî Muzıkaları Tarihi*, 131.

⁹⁴ Özdemir Nutku, *Darülbedayi'nin*, 41; *İkdâm* (10 Mart 1334); *İkdâm* (13 Mart 1334)

⁹⁵ Özdemir Nutku, *Darülbedayi'nin*, 43; *Temasâ* (15 Ağustos 1334)

⁹⁶ Burhan Arpad, 'Koruyan Ölü', *Hafta* 10 (9 Mart 1956); *Yeni İstanbul* no. 1911 (14 Mart 1955); Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 74.

⁹⁷ *Yeni İstanbul* 1913 (16 Mart 1955); Eyice, 177; Kickingereder, 'Celâl Esad Arseven's Memoirs', 38-9, n.15; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 74.

⁹⁸ See D. A. Howard, *The history of Turkey* (Wesport, London, 2001), 91-114; Shaw and Shaw, *History of the Ottoman empire and modern Turkey*, vol. 2.

consultant to Prof. H. Jansen in constructing the development plan of Ankara.⁹⁹ In 1926, he translates and publishes Camillo Sitte's work under the name of *Şehir Mimarisi* (Urban Architecture).¹⁰⁰ This could be considered as an extension of the lessons he gave at *Sanayi-I Nefise Mektebi*. He tries to find a remedy to the terminological deficiency in the field of arts to some extent with *Fransızcadan Türkçeye Türkçeden Fransızcaya Sanat Kamusu* (Dictionary of art terms from French to Turkish and from Turkish to French) published in 1925-6 in two volumes.¹⁰¹ In 1928, this dictionary is followed by the first part of *Mimari Tarihi* (Architectural history) subtitled *Kunun-I Kadime* (Old Ages). In 1926, he is appointed as general director of *Darülbedayi* and simultaneously carries on his position as Publications Director of Istanbul Chamber of Commerce. He presides over the trip organized by Istanbul Chamber of Commerce to present and publicize Turkish goods in foreign markets; upon his return he publishes his impressions in *Seyyar Sergi ile Seyahat İntibaları* (Impressions of a journey with the traveling exhibition).

An important cultural debate dominated Republican Turkey in early 1930s. Several studies were conducted in various disciplines such as history, philology, art and anthropology with the aim of investigating the origins of Turkish culture. All these studies finally came to agree that Turks were entitled to one of the oldest civilizations. The pre-Islamic periods of Turkish culture were emphasized; based on the available data the presence of a cultural continuity from Middle Asia until the present was underlined. As early as 1928, Celâl Esad had made a successful presentation of this argument in *Türk Sanatı* (Turkish Art) published among *Türk Ocakları Neşriyatı*.¹⁰² An extended edition of this work was published in 1939 in French with the title *L'art Turc*.¹⁰³ Keeping in mind the necessities dictated by the present in terms of both art and architecture, Celâl Esad has investigated the part played primarily by modern architecture in social development and in his *Yeni Mimari* (New architecture) dated 1931 he has emphasized the functionality of

⁹⁹ Eyice, 177; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 74.

¹⁰⁰ This was one of other works on urbanisation that were translated in the context of attempts made to improve the city; see Ozaşlan, *Historic urban fabric*, 96 n.39

¹⁰¹ The first modern Ottoman Turkish dictionary of art terminology: [Arseven], Celâl Esad, *Fransızcadan Türkçeye Türkçeden Fransızcaya Sanat Kamusu: Dictionnaire des termes d'art Français -Turc, Turc-Français* (Istanbul, 1926); see Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 121, n.223.

¹⁰² Celal Esad Arseven, *Türk Sanatı*, (1928; repr. Istanbul, 1984); D. Kuban, 'Celâl Esad Arseven ve Türk Sanatı Kavramı', *Mimarlık*, Yıl 7, no. 72 (Ekim, 1969) , 18.

¹⁰³ Celal Esad Arseven, *L'art Turc: depuis son origine jusqu'à nos jours* (Istanbul, 1939).

architectural aesthetics freed from conservatism.¹⁰⁴ He has carried on this approach in his translation of E. G. Benito's *Yeni Resim Hakkında* (On New Art) published in 1947.

When *Türk Tarihinin Ana Hatları* (Outlines of Turkish history), prepared in 1930 with the initiative of Cemal Atatürk (d. 1938), was re-handled as a comprehensive project in 1932, Celâl Esad appears as a contributor. He writes *Türklerde Mimari* (Architecture of the Turks) (1932) with this purpose in mind.¹⁰⁵ This little booklet is revised and published again in 1934 with the title *Türklerde Mimari: Eti ve Selçuk Mimarileri* (Architecture of the Turks: Architecture of Hitites and Selçukids). In 1937, when he was the director of Kadıköy Halkevi,¹⁰⁶ he publishes *Şehircilik* (Urbanism). In *Les arts décoratifs Turcs*, he examines Turkish decorative arts and meticulously specifies the differences between Turkish style of motifs and Arabic-Iranian ornamentation.¹⁰⁷ This work is followed by his colossal five-volume work *Sanat Ansiklopedisi* (Encyclopedia of art) published as single issues between 1943 and 1952.¹⁰⁸ He was voted member of the parliament in 1942 and 1946.¹⁰⁹ In 1951 he was made a member of *Gayrimenkul Eski Eserler ve Anıtlar Yüksek Kurulu*, which he chaired between 1951 and 1953.¹¹⁰ Having received the State Culture Award on 24 October 1971, Celâl Esad passed away on 13 November 1971.¹¹¹

¹⁰⁴ B. Özer, 'Celâl Esad Arseven', *Mimarlık*, Yıl 7, no. 72 (Ekim, 1969), 21-4.

¹⁰⁵ *Türklerde mimari* (Ankara, 1939).

¹⁰⁶ *Kadıköy Halkevi (1935-1938)* (Istanbul, 1938). From 1956 he began the series of *Türk Sanatı Tarihi*.; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 74.

¹⁰⁷ *Les arts décoratifs turcs* (Istanbul, 1952); N. Miraç Ümit, 'Celal Esad Arseven, 'Türk Sanatında Tezyinat', *Hayat Mecmuası*, C. I, S. 20 (Ankara, Nisan 1927), 389-94 (Osmanlıcadan Çeviri)', *Art Sanat* 2 (2014), 337-52; for examples, see D. Alexander, 'Pisanello's hat: the costume and weapons depicted in Pisanello's medal for John VIII Palaeologus. A discussion of the saber and related weapons', *Gladius XXIV* (2004), 135-86, 159; V. D. Kyriazopoulos, 'The contribution of the Christians in Asia Minor pottery', *Balkan Studies* 19 (1978), 77-103, 84.

¹⁰⁸ *Sanat Ansiklopedisi* (Istanbul, 1943-52); V. Serdaroğlu, 'When literature and architecture meet: architectural images of the beloved and the lover in sixteenth-century Ottoman poetry', *Muqarnas* 23 (2006), 273-88, n.36, n.46; T. Metin, 'The impact of the city formation in Great Seljuks on the city culture of Anatolian Seljuks', *The Journal of Academic Social Science Studies* 26 ii. (2014), 357-70, 362, n.27.

¹⁰⁹ Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 74; Kickingereder, 'Celâl Esad Arseven's Memoirs', 39, n.16. The surname Arseven ('The one who loves art') was chosen by Celâl Esad when surnames became compulsory in 1934.

¹¹⁰ Eyice, 177; Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 74.

¹¹¹ Sürün, *Cumhuriyet Öncesi Sanat*, 74.